



## Can Performance and Representation Improve Public Perceptions of Police Legitimacy in Pursuing Domestic Violence Cases?

Kimberly Madsen (Indiana University, United States)

### Abstract

This paper explores how including women on police forces may improve outcomes for women and increase public perception of police legitimacy when addressing domestic violence. The theory of representative bureaucracy suggests that bureaucracies will be more responsive to the public and may garner additional legitimacy when they reflect the demographics of those they serve (Mosher 1968). This paper examines female representation in Kosovo, a country that has experienced ethnic conflict and gender violence and employs an experimental survey to understand how women rate police officers responding to domestic violence in the areas of trust, seriousness in carrying out investigations, and fairness. In the scenario where a respondent had little information about the policies of a force and could only see the demographic makeup of police, representation became an important influence for women on how they rated legitimacy of police in all areas. In the scenario where a policy was enacted that would benefit victims of domestic violence, performance mattered to both men and women for all three dimensions of legitimacy, whereas information on whether a man or woman enacted the policy had little impact. Implications of these findings are that if citizens know little about their police forces, representation becomes increasingly important. But even a less representative force can gain legitimacy by enacting effective policies that benefit less represented groups.

Keywords: gender, domestic violence, post-conflict, representation, policing

Gender equality is the fifth UN Sustainable Development Goal and includes ending all forms of discrimination and violence against women and girls in public and private settings (UN Women, 2022). Global research on 39 countries shows that having female police officers on a force is positively correlated with reports of sexual violence, and male and female victims report a preference for reporting to female officers (UN Women 2011). Studies suggest that female officers improve the quality of policing, increase rates of reporting and arrest for domestic violence, support affected citizens, help prevent escalation of domestic violence, and lead to declines in intimate partner homicide and rates of repeated abuse (Miller and Segal 2014; Meier and Nicholson-Crotty 2006; Andrews and Miller 2013; Jordan 2001; Sun 2007).

These findings point to a role of looking at domestic violence from a representative bureaucracy lens; bureaucracies may be more responsive to publics and garner additional legitimacy when they reflect the demographics of those they serve (Mosher 1968 and Krislov 1974). Passive representation, where the bureaucracy looks more like those they serve, can extend legitimacy to a public organization through a more symbolic role (Selden 1997) and may help communities

feel enfranchised when they see a bureaucrat who looks like them (Ricucci and Saidel 1997; Selden 1997; Thielemann and Stewart 1996, as referenced in Meier and Nicholson-Crotty 2006). Active representation, where representatives press for the interests of those they serve (Mosher, 1968), may increase public perceptions of legitimacy where bureaucrats share and act on values held by those they represent. Both passive and active representation are important to understanding legitimacy because while passive representation is a necessary but insufficient condition for active representation, each on its own may lead to different ends: passive representation may achieve demographic or symbolic representation as an end goal whereas active representation focuses on policy outcomes and implementation undertaken by those doing the representing (Meier and Nicholson-Crotty, 2006). This study addresses the need to examine representation in varied contexts by examining the role of passive and active gender representation in Kosovo, a country in the Balkans that has experienced gender-based violence during conflict. Its political context is interesting in that Kosovo is a young country established on ideals of gender representation in political, bureaucratic, societal, and cultural contexts (Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo, 2008). This context allows for a better understanding of how more equitable gender representation affects perceptions of legitimacy in post-conflict areas.

This chapter employs an experimental survey based on the work of Ricucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena (2014) to understand how women and men living in post-conflict areas rate legitimacy of police officers in the areas of trust, seriousness in carrying out investigations, and fairness when there is passive and active representation. Respondents were asked to rate each of these dimensions of legitimacy for police forces with varying levels of gender representation and performance. In passive scenarios, female respondents rated units with higher female representation as more legitimate along each of the dimensions of legitimacy; for men, ratings only increased for how fair police are in carrying out investigations. Both men and women rated police units as more legitimate in the areas of how seriously they pursued investigations and how trustworthy they were while performance was not correlated with legitimacy in either group. In the active representation scenario, having a female in charge of a policy change was not correlated with higher ratings of police legitimacy among men or women, but higher performance was significant in all areas of legitimacy for both men and women.

### **Theoretical Framework**

Representative bureaucracy is concerned with the proportional representation of populations in bureaucratic agencies, as well as with the impacts that representation has on policy making and implementation (Meier and Nicholson-Crotty 2006). Mosher (1968, 12) defines passive representation as “concern[ing] the source of origin of individuals and the degree to which, collectively, they mirror the society” and active as representation where the bureaucrat presses for the interests of those individuals whose interests they represent. The theory suggests that bureaucracies will be more responsive to publics and more accountable when they reflect the demographics of those they serve (Denhardt and deLeon 1995; Mosher 1968; Krislov 1974; Krislov and Rosenbloom 1981; Meier 1975; Selden 1997; Meier and Stewart 1992; Theobald and Haider-Markel 2008; Sowa and Selden 2003). Krislov (1974) suggested that the notion of

representation implies additional legitimacy as the smaller stands for and encapsulates the larger body represented.

### **Legitimacy and Values**

One mechanism of representative bureaucracy discussed in the literature is the role of representation in relation to legitimacy (see Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena, 2014; Peters, Maravic, and Schroter, 2015; Gravier, 2013; Theobald and Haider-Markel, 2009). Researchers have found evidence that passive representation influences citizen perceptions of performance, trustworthiness, fairness, and legitimacy of police (Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena, 2014; Theobald and Haider-Markel, 2009; Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Jackson 2018). Additionally, decisions that benefit the public can serve to legitimize the actions of government bureaucracies (Selden, 1997).

Citizen perceptions of legitimacy are increasingly important for countries that have undergone shifts in governance, borders, and ethnic conflict. The trust and confidence necessary to build community are broken down in societies that have been consumed by violence where neighbors prey on neighbors (Brinkerhoff, 2007). In areas where conflicts have occurred along ethnic and religious lines, these characteristics become particularly salient in future interactions with the state. Esman (1999, 365) emphasizes that the legitimacy of government in post-conflict areas is conditioned on seeing fellow ethnics wielding power at political levels and in state bureaucracies, being able to compete for and attain those positions, and providing “sympathetic hearing” and protection of allocation of services and provision of benefits.

Literature in the social sciences on legitimacy includes several conceptualizations of legitimacy: legitimacy as capturing beliefs that government power is exercised fairly in the interest of the whole nation (Levi and Sacks, 2009; Cromartie, 2018); as carrying out procedures correctly and fairly (Levi, Sacks, and Taylor 2009; Koppell, 2008; Scholte and Tallberg, 2018; Hurd, 2007; Tallberg and Zurn, 2019; Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena 2014); as justness measured through evaluations of appropriateness (Knox, 2016); as actions undertaken by government being seen as trustworthy (Parsons, 1960; Levi, Sacks, and Talyor 2009; Suchman 1995; Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena 2014); and as based on calculated self-interests of constituents of whether the organization’s activities will benefit their group (Suchman, 1995). These underlying components of legitimacy can serve as proxies to understand legitimacy as a whole. Each concept highlights the importance of individual perceptions in evaluating legitimacy of the bureaucracy and indicates that public perceptions of legitimacy will be informed by personal values that have been formed within and shared across social groups. If bureaucrats mirror the demographic characteristics of those they serve, they are more likely to encompass their values and make decisions to benefit those they serve (Meier and Nigro 1976). When these values are espoused and applied to decision making, they may influence public perceptions of how procedures are carried out, how appropriate resulting actions are, and how fair and trustworthy bureaucrats are.

Legitimacy based on the actions of the bureaucracy can be divided into two types: performance legitimacy and procedural legitimacy. From the perspective of performance legitimacy, legitimacy is derived from government performance and effectiveness. Thus, states possess performance legitimacy in the eyes of citizens when they improve living standards in addition to filling state functions (Francois and Sud, 2006). It is related to collective gains, distributive justice, favorable outcomes, and fairness (Scholte and Tallberg, 2018; Hurd, 2007). Procedural legitimacy, on the other hand, embodies efficiency, expertise, impartiality, participation, accountability, problem solving, and correct procedure (Tallberg and Zurn, 2017; Scholte and Tallberg, 2018; Hurd, 2007). The emphasis on performance and procedural legitimacy justifies looking not only at citizen perceptions of legitimacy, but also at actions the state undertakes that may alter those perceptions.

The final aspect of legitimacy examined here is how legitimacy relates to values held by individuals. The foundation of legitimacy is based on justness and evaluations of appropriateness (Knox, 2016). These evaluations that lead to legitimacy have been described as “a generalized perception or assumption that the actions of an entity are desirable, proper, or appropriate within some socially constructed system of norms, values, beliefs, and definitions” (Suchman, 1995, pg. 574). Citizen perceptions of legitimacy then will be informed by personal values that have been formed within and shared across their social groups. Thus, criteria for determining legitimacy will be based on values citizens hold.

### **Gender, Policing, and Representative Bureaucracy**

Several researchers in representative bureaucracy have written about the importance of values and beliefs accounting for positive effects of representation. Background experiences and personal attitudes of civil servants are a key determinant of decision making, and partiality, shared values, beliefs, and empathic understanding are connected to representativeness; these shared values and beliefs lead to substantive results as minority bureaucrats articulate the interests of their group during decision-making processes (Van Riper, 1958; Lim 2006). Meier and Nicholson-Crotty (2006, 850) highlight that representative bureaucracy “assumes that shared experiences or values, which may not be shared across gender or race divisions, fundamentally affect the decisions made by and the actions taken by the bureaucrat.” Active representation could affect perceptions of legitimacy based on citizen perceptions that the bureaucracy is acting on their behalf and pressing for their interests. Because the reflections of one’s own values is inherent to legitimacy, a potential mechanism for building legitimacy is likely through representation as residents interact with bureaucracies when interfacing with the government.

Researchers have looked at both gender and policing extensively with the representative bureaucracy literature (Meier and Nicholson-Crotty, 2006; Keiser et al. 2002; Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena, 2014; Andrews and Miller, 2013). Keiser et al. (2002) discussed three types of issues where gender representation is likely to occur: (1) policies that benefit women as a class; (2) policies that through the political process have been defined as gendered and may therefore be more salient to women; and (3) instances where gender fundamentally changes the relationship with the client. In the area of policing, the importance of female representation has been shown

in the US and England. Gender representation on police forces influences perceived job performance, trustworthiness, and fairness; greater numbers of women on police forces leads to higher rates of reporting rape and processing rape cases; and female police chief constables are associated with higher arrest rates for domestic violence though an increase in female police officers is only significant when they are able to carry out front-line police work (Ricucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena, 2014; Andrews and Miller, 2013; Schuck, 2018; Nicholson-Crotty et al. 2018).

Meier and Nicholson-Crotty (2006) suggest four theoretical reasons a police force with more female officers may lead to better outcomes in issues affecting women: (1) a woman who sees more women on a force could assume sexual assault is taken more seriously; (2) a woman will be more likely to have a female officer as first point of contact; (3) female officers may sensitize their male colleagues; and (4) a female officer could share a set of values with female residents because of common gender-related experiences. Note that only the final reason directly depends on the actions of an officer representing her group; the others involve others' perceptions (either the perception of those reporting or of male officers after interacting with female officers). As such, the authors note that in two of these mechanisms, there does not need to be contact between a citizen and a female officer for representation to occur: (1) female clients may observe more women patrolling in their city, and (2) female officers may share a set of values with other women.

Because the gender of police officers should be more salient to those who are usually underrepresented, women may care more about female representation on police forces than their male counterparts, which would lead them to rate officers as being more legitimate along the three dimensions discussed above. This leads to the following hypotheses:

H1: Women will rate units with higher levels of gender representation as more legitimate

H2: Women's ratings of bureaucrat's legitimacy will increase further when a female bureaucrat is seen actively pursuing the interests of their group

Representation may not be the only factor in citizen's evaluations of bureaucratic legitimacy. Literature on representative bureaucracy implies that representation improves performance, whether directly or indirectly, through impact on bureaucrat's decisions or citizen perceptions (Andrews et al., 2016). However, representation is likely not the only factor influencing good performance. Research on police performance indicates that factors like psychological and physiological stress responses and training in a variety of methods impact police performance positively or negatively (Andersen and Gustafsberg, 2016; Arnetz, Arble, Backman, Lynch, & Lublin, 2013; Arnetz, Nevedal, Lumley, Backman, & Lublin, 2009). As such, performance itself can influence perceptions of legitimacy outside of performance gains that are driven by representation. This leads to the following hypothesis:

H3: Women will rate units with higher levels of performance as more legitimate when controlling for levels of representation

Research has explored whether there is an interaction effect between representation and performance. Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena (2014) explore whether citizens more positively evaluate an agency when there is both high representation and high performance and find that while both matter separately, there does not seem to be an interaction between representation and performance in their context. Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Jackson (2018) find that the interaction between representation and performance is not significant for black respondents, though it is for white respondents. These studies indicate that performance and representation are significant separately, but that the interaction of the two is not consistent across groups.

### **Kosovo Context: Domestic Violence**

From its inception as a nation, leaders of Kosovo have identified gender representation as a value and tool for more effective government. The 2008 constitution and subsequent civil service laws recognize the need for equal opportunities for men and women (Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo, 2008; Law on Civil Service, 2010). Increasing gender representation on police forces is a prominent area of focus for improving the civil service in Kosovo and has been an aim of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE), which has supported the Association of Women in the Kosovo Police since 2004 (OSCE, 2019). A 2018 campaign featured female KP officers, retired American Chief of Police, and the U.S. Embassy's Department of Justice police support program (ICITAP) encouraging women to join the police force (U.S. Embassy Pristina, 2018). However, in 2017 women remained underrepresented and made up only 14% of the 8,820 Kosovo Police, including constituting 11% of uniformed officers (Farnsworth et al., 2018). In 2019, out of the 430 KP officers hired to go to basic training, 30.9% were female; additionally, a 2019 mandate required 30% of participants at trainings to be female (Jones 2020).

Responding to domestic violence has been another focus of the Kosovo Police. Progress in the legal framework for addressing domestic violence was made in 2018, when the Criminal Code was revised to define and treat domestic violence separate from other offenses; in 2019, 650 more cases were reported than in 2017 (UN Women 2019). Failing to comply with a civil court judgment on domestic violence is considered a criminal and prosecutable offense, though prosecution is rare (US Department of State, 2019).

Police data in Kosovo indicate 94% of gender-based violence is perpetrated by men, and 62% of Kosovars have experienced domestic violence (68% of women and 56% of men) (*ibid.*). In 2017, of the 1,125 cases of reported domestic violence, 76% of the victims were women (*ibid.*). Police are often the first to respond to domestic violence calls, and while 73.6% of Kosovars say they would turn to the police to assist with domestic violence, many do not trust officers to follow through with investigations (UN Women 2017). Female police are actively working to change the culture of normalizing and dismissing domestic violence cases (*ibid.*). In a training for Kosovo Police, Jane Townsley, founder of Force International, retired UK senior police officer, and experienced gender specialist in the field of policing and security, emphasized the importance of domestic violence units, trust and confidence in police, gender-responsive policing, and effective policies. She noted that "effective police response is a major contributing factor to the reputation of Kosovo Police" (UN Women 2018).

Despite institutionalized values of representation, sexual violence is still a concerning issue in Kosovo. Research conducted by Human Rights Watch found that rape and other forms of sexual violence were used as “weapons of war and instruments of systematic ethnic cleansing” during the conflict with Serbia (Human Rights Watch, 2000). Much of this violence occurred as police officers joined military groups in carrying out actions against the general population. Unfortunately, sexual violence has not been limited to the conflict. Recent statistics reported by the Kosovo Women’s Network indicate that more than two-thirds of women have been victims of domestic violence, and women’s rights groups in Kosovo report that workplace sexual harassment and abuse often go unreported for fear of dismissal or retaliation (US Department of State, 2019). A high-profile domestic violence case in 2018 that resulted in the murder of the perpetrator’s wife and nine-year-old daughter sparked public protests, as the victims’ relatives claimed they contacted Kosovo Police (KP) multiple times to request assistance, including reporting a death threat four hours before the murder. The murderer was later found guilty and sentenced to 24 years in prison (US Department of State, 2019). In February 2019, Kosovo women protested outside Kosovo Police Headquarters in Pristina after a teenager reported to police that she had been raped by a teacher; she was then assaulted by the Kosovo Police Officer to whom she reported and was forced to have an abortion (Surk, 2019). The Kosovo Police Inspectorate reported that 11 police officers were accused of domestic violence in 2019 and nine in 2020 (Ahmeti 2021).

The focus on institution-building, increasing the number of women on the police force, and continued salience of sexual violence in Kosovo, make this an appropriate area to research whether increased numbers of women on police forces, women in positions of authority to make policy choices, and enhanced performance lead to increased perceptions of legitimacy.

## **Data**

The data for this chapter come from an experimental survey administered in Kosovo in September 2019. Participants rated trust, fairness, and performance of Kosovo Police in both a passive representation and active representation scenario involving domestic violence. In the passive scenario participants were randomly assigned a ratio of male to female police officers of either 9:1 or 5:5 for a police force that receives calls reporting domestic violence, conducts investigations, and makes determinations for which actions should be taken. Participants were also randomly assigned a police performance measure of 70% or 30% arrests and were told that arrests reduce the number of victims seriously injured or killed due to domestic violence. These numbers were chosen to indicate low and high representation and poorer and higher performance and are based on a similar experiment from Ricucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena (2014); the researchers chose these values based on several cognitive pretests found to be salient on both gender and performance factors. After reading the scenarios, respondents were asked to rate how seriously police pursue an investigation, how much of the time citizens can trust police in the scenario to do what is right, and how fair they would say police are likely to be in handling domestic violence cases.

For the active scenario, the same participants were then randomly assigned to a scenario where either a male or female had been promoted to oversee the handling of domestic violence cases. They were told the officer implemented a new system where victims of domestic violence meet with officers of their own gender to report the crime, and it is now mandatory to arrest perpetrators of domestic violence. They were then randomized into a group where domestic violence decreased by either 80 or 20 percent and told victims reported they feel more comfortable reporting domestic violence crimes to police. These thresholds are also based on research by Riccucci, Van Ryzin, and Lavena (2014). Respondents were again asked to rate how seriously police pursue an investigation, how much of the time citizens can trust police in the scenario to do what is right, and how fair they would say police are likely to be in handling domestic violence cases.

Because respondents were first assigned to passive and then to the active scenario, there should not be any influence from the active scenario on the passive; however, respondents could have been influenced by the passive scenario when answering questions about the active scenario. To ensure this was not the case, ratings of how seriously police pursue investigations, trust, and fairness in the active scenario were regressed on assignment to both passive representation and performance. Neither passive assignment variable was significant, indicating that exposure to the passive scenario did not influence ratings in the active scenario.

Randomization in each scenario meant all participants were assigned to one of four possible groups for both the passive and active scenarios, as shown in figures one and two.

**Figure 1: Domestic Violence Randomization (Passive)**

<p>Group 1: Low Representation, Low Performance (N=87)</p> <p>Kosovo Police in Qytet/Grad receive calls reporting domestic violence, conduct investigations of these crimes, and make determinations as to what actions should be taken. The officers assigned to this city <b>include 9 men and 1 woman.</b></p> <p>According to a recent assessment, the police in Qytet/Grad made a mandatory arrest of the batterer in <b>30% of cases.</b> Evidence shows that making such arrests reduces the number of victims seriously injured or killed as a result of domestic violence.</p>	<p>Group 2: Low Representation, High Performance (N=112)</p> <p>Kosovo Police in Qytet/Grad receive calls reporting domestic violence, conduct investigations of these crimes, and make determinations as to what actions should be taken. The officers assigned to this city <b>include 9 men and 1 woman.</b></p> <p>According to a recent assessment, the police in Qytet/Grad made a mandatory arrest of the batterer in <b>70% of cases.</b> Evidence shows that making such arrests reduces the number of victims seriously injured or killed as a result of domestic violence.</p>
---	---



<p><b>Group 3: High Representation, Low Performance</b> (N=125)</p> <p>Kosovo Police in Qytet/Grad receive calls reporting domestic violence, conduct investigations of these crimes, and make determinations as to what actions should be taken. The officers assigned to this city <b>include 5 men and 5 women.</b></p> <p>According to a recent assessment, the police in Qytet/Grad made a mandatory arrest of the batterer in <b>30% of cases.</b> Evidence shows that making such arrests reduces the number of victims seriously injured or killed as a result of domestic violence.</p>	<p><b>Group 4: High Representation, High Performance</b> (N=120)</p> <p>Kosovo Police in Qytet/Grad receive calls reporting domestic violence, conduct investigations of these crimes, and make determinations as to what actions should be taken. The officers assigned to this city <b>include 5 men and 5 women.</b></p> <p>According to a recent assessment, the police in Qytet/Grad made a mandatory arrest of the batterer in <b>70% of cases.</b> Evidence shows that making such arrests reduces the number of victims seriously injured or killed as a result of domestic violence.</p>
--	---

**Figure 2: Domestic Violence Randomization (Active)**

<p><b>Group 1: Low Representation, Low Performance</b> (N=132)</p> <p>Recently in Qytet/Grad, a <b>male</b> officer was promoted to oversee handling of domestic violence cases. This officer implemented a new system where victims of domestic violence meet with officers of their own gender to report the crime, and it is now mandatory to arrest perpetrators of domestic violence.</p> <p>Rates of domestic violence have decreased by <b>20%</b> in the city, with victims saying they feel more comfortable reporting domestic violence crimes to police.</p>	<p><b>Group 2: Low Representation, High Performance</b> (N=111)</p> <p>Recently in Qytet/Grad, a <b>male</b> officer was promoted to oversee handling of domestic violence cases. This officer implemented a new system where victims of domestic violence meet with officers of their own gender to report the crime, and it is now mandatory to arrest perpetrators of domestic violence.</p> <p>Rates of domestic violence have decreased by <b>80%</b> in the city, with victims saying they feel more comfortable reporting domestic violence crimes to police.</p>
---	--

<p>Group 3: High Representation, Low Performance (N=112)</p> <p>Recently in Qytet/Grad, a <b>female</b> officer was promoted to oversee handling of domestic violence cases. This officer implemented a new system where victims of domestic violence meet with officers of their own gender to report the crime, and it is now mandatory to arrest perpetrators of domestic violence.</p> <p>Rates of domestic violence have decreased by <b>20%</b> in the city, with victims saying they feel more comfortable reporting domestic violence crimes to police.</p>	<p>Group 4: High Representation, High Performance (N=135)</p> <p>Recently in Qytet/Grad, a <b>female</b> officer was promoted to oversee handling of domestic violence cases. This officer implemented a new system where victims of domestic violence meet with officers of their own gender to report the crime, and it is now mandatory to arrest perpetrators of domestic violence.</p> <p>Rates of domestic violence have decreased by <b>80%</b> in the city, with victims saying they feel more comfortable reporting domestic violence crimes to police.</p>
---	--

The survey was given to a representative sample of all ethnic communities and equal numbers of men and women from the 38 major municipalities in Kosovo ages 18 and up (N=490). Weighting was introduced to the sample by multiplying the minorities by a factor of 2.41 for every one Albanian.<sup>1</sup> This ensured 50 Serbian respondents and 50 respondents from other minorities. Responses were weighted accordingly in all analyses. The sampling method used is a multi-staged random probability method (typical of surveys in Kosovo). Stage one accounts for the appropriate rural/urban divide (45% urban/55% rural) of the country. Stage two refers to selecting households using a random-house technique. This consists of an assigned starting point in a given direction. In urban areas, the selected household is each third house/address on the left-hand side of the street. In block-of-flats the selected household is every third apartment, counting from the top floor in each entrance. In rural areas, the selected household is every third inhabitable dwelling on both sides of the interviewer's route. Stage three selects one member of the household using the nearest birthday technique. Stage four accounts for substitution of a respondent after two attempts (one initial visit and one call back).

Table 1 below shows the descriptive statistics for assignment to the passive representation domestic violence scenario while Table 2 shows descriptive statistics for the active representation domestic violence scenario. Approximately 52% of all respondents are female, 89% are Albanian, and 5% are Serb (before weighting, this was 61% Albanian and 18% Serb).<sup>2</sup> The average monthly income is 648 Euros and the average age is 36. All models control for gender (female=1; male=0), age (a continuous variable), marital status (married=1; else 0), ethnicity (defined as Serb, Albanian, and other), administrative district (7 dummy variables indicating district the respondent resides in), education (a categorical variable with six categories where 6<sup>th</sup>-9<sup>th</sup> grade is the lowest

<sup>1</sup> Analyses were conducted without weighting and found similar results.

<sup>2</sup> Kosovo statistics show 92.9% of the population are Albanian, and 1.5% are Serb. However, these estimates may under-represent Serb and some other ethnic minorities because they are based on the 2011 Kosovo national census, which excluded northern Kosovo (a largely Serb-inhabited region) and was partially boycotted by Serb and Romani communities in southern Kosovo (CIA, 2020).

category and doctorate is the highest), and monthly income (ranging from less than 400 Euros/month to over 1000 Euros/month).

**Table 1. Descriptive Statistics for Passive Scenario by Group**

Variable	Low Rep/Low Perf	Low Rep/High Perf	High Rep/Low Perf	High Rep/High Perf	Total	Total Percentage
<i># of Respondents</i>	95	123	136	136	490	100%
<i>Gender</i>						
Female	52	54	72	77	255	52%
Male	43	69	64	59	235	48%
<i>Ethnicity</i>						
Serb	3	7	9	7	26	5%
Albanian	88	112	117	118	435	89%
Other	4	4	10	11	29	6%
<i>Age</i>						
Under 20	14	12	8	9	43	9%
20-24	20	34	21	30	105	21%
25-34	23	29	41	32	125	26%
35-44	12	19	26	28	85	17%
45-54	9	10	23	19	61	12%
55-59	10	6	10	10	36	7%
60-64	3	4	6	4	17	3%
65-74	0	6	1	4	11	2%
75-84	3	1	0	0	4	1%
<i>Education</i>						
6th-9th	5	9	13	15	42.47	9%
10th-13th	30	33	34	29	126	26%
Associates	12	25	17	19	73	15%
Bachelors	32	46	48	54	180	37%
Masters	15	9	22	19	65	13%
PhD/MD	0	0	2	0	2	0%
<i>Marital</i>						
Single/Divorced	48	51	59	69	227	46%
Married	47	72	77	67	263	54%

*Monthly Income (Euros)*

<400	21	29	35	36	121	25%
400-700	40	45	52	45	182	37%
700-1000	20	20	28	39	107	22%
>1000	13	28	22	17	80	16%

**Table 2. Descriptive Statistics for Active Scenario by Group**

Variable	Low Rep/Low Perf	Low Rep/High Perf	High Rep/Low Perf	High Rep/High Perf	Total	Total Percentage
<i># of Respondents</i>	132	111	112	135	490	100%
<i>Gender</i>						
Female	79	52	62	63	256	52%
Male	53	59	50	72	234	48%
<i>Ethnicity</i>						
Serb	7	6	8	6	27	6%
Albanian	118	100	97	121	436	89%
Other	8	6	6	9	29	6%
<i>Age</i>						
Under 20	14	7	13	11	45	9%
20-24	29	26	26	26	107	22%
25-34	34	33	31	28	126	26%
35-44	21	21	18	24	84	17%
45-54	12	14	13	22	61	12%
55-59	13	5	7	10	35	7%
60-64	6	2	1	8	17	3%
65-74	4	2	3	3	12	2%
75-84	0	1	0	3	4	1%
<i>Education</i>						
6th-9th	10	9	6	16	41	8%
10th-13th	35	25	24	42	126	26%
Associates	22	21	17	14	74	15%
Bachelors	53	39	45	43	180	37%
Masters	12	17	19	18	66	13%
PhD/MD	0	0	1	1	2	0%

*Marital*

Single/Divorced	75	51	59	62	247	50%
Married	57	60	53	73	243	50%
<i>Monthly Income (Euros)</i>						
<400	34	28	29	30	121	25%
400-700	42	49	37	55	183	37%
700-1000	34	24	20	27	105	21%
>1000	22	11	26	23	82	17%

Balance tests were carried out using a t-test to ensure randomization occurred. For the passive representation scenario, respondents were first randomized into a representative or non-representative group. No characteristics were significant except for age. For the assignment to high or low performance for the passive scenario, t-tests were not significant except for marital status. For the active scenario, all characteristics were not significant for the random assignment to higher and lower representation. For the performance assignment for the active scenario, only gender was significant. Non-significant results of the t-test indicate that proper randomization occurred (see Appendix A).

The dependent variables in this study capture components of procedural legitimacy: 1) how seriously police pursue investigations, 2) how often they can be trusted to do the right thing, and 3) how fair police are in handling investigations. Seriousness in pursuing investigations is strongly correlated with trusting police to do the right thing (both passive and active scenarios  $r=0.8$ ), and fairness in handling investigations is moderately correlated with both seriousness and trust (passive:  $r=0.5$  for both; active:  $r=0.7$  for both) (see Appendix A Tables 5 and 6 for correlation tables). These correlations indicate overlap in the concepts being measured and represent a potential weakness in the current study. Each of the dependent variables are rated using a five-point Likert scale. The main explanatory variables of interest are the two assignment groups respondents were randomly assigned to: how representative the police force is of the population and high or low police performance. Additional controls include respondent age, gender, marital status, municipality, and education.

All analyses below report coefficients of linear regressions. Ordinal logits were also performed as a robustness check and the same variables were found to be significant in both models. All models were run with interactions between the two assignment variables, and the interactions were not significant in any models. These interactions were dropped in subsequent analyses.

## Findings

Hypothesis one stated that women will rate units with higher levels of gender representation as more legitimate. As reported in Table 3 below, women who were assigned to the more representative group were more likely to give police higher ratings for how seriously they carried out investigations ( $p<0.05$ ), how much they trusted police to do the right thing ( $p<0.05$ ), and how fair they were in handling investigations ( $p<0.001$ ). The same assignment is not significant among

male respondent for how seriously police pursue investigations and trusting police to do the right thing ( $p=0.24$  and  $0.22$  respectively). However, being assigned to a more representative police force is correlated with men having higher perceptions that police handled investigations more fairly ( $p<0.10$ ).

**Table 3. Effects of a More Representative Police Force on Perceptions of Legitimacy**

		Passive				
		St	P-			
		Coeff	Error	Value	R <sup>2</sup>	N
<i>Seriously Pursue Investigation</i>	Females	0.329	0.164	<b>0.046</b>	0.179	246
	Males	0.248	0.169	0.143	0.173	244
<i>Trust Police to Do the Right Thing</i>	Females	0.307	0.151	<b>0.043</b>	0.171	246
	Males	0.227	0.166	0.172	0.138	244
<i>Fairness in Handling Investigations</i>	Females	0.634	0.170	<b>0.000</b>	0.167	246
	Males	0.487	0.182	<b>0.008</b>	0.140	244

This suggests that, for women, a more representative police force increases perceptions in all three aspects of legitimacy while it only impacts men's perceptions in the area of fairness. Men may see women as being more fair, but this does not translate into perceptions that the work on the case (carrying out the investigation and trusting that they will do the right thing) will be impacted. Notably, the coefficients for fairness are higher for men and women than the other two aspects of legitimacy. Since trust and seriousness are more closely correlated, it is consistent with men reacting similarly to these measures.

Hypothesis two states that women will rate units with higher levels of gender representation as more legitimate when bureaucrats actively pursue the interests of their group. In this experiment, this means women should rate units with a female officer overseeing domestic violence efforts as more legitimate. However, Table 4 below shows that neither men nor women being assigned to a group where a woman is promoted to lead domestic violence efforts is consistently correlated with increases in ratings of police officers. The only exception is for females in their ratings of trusting police to do the right thing ( $p<.10$  in both cases). The scenario only differed between whether a woman or man put an effective policy in place. Regardless of gender, the outcome was the same. This may point to the importance of how effective the policy was rather than the gender of the officer establishing the policy and is addressed in hypothesis three below.

**Table 4. Effects of a Female Enacting a Policy on Perceptions of Legitimacy**

		Active				
		Coeff	St Error	P-Value	R <sup>2</sup>	N
<i>Seriously Pursue Investigation</i>	Females	0.192	0.169	0.258	0.268	246
	Males	0.238	0.167	0.154	0.182	244
<i>Trust Police to Do the Right Thing</i>	Females	0.257	0.154	<b>0.096</b>	0.278	246
	Males	0.120	0.165	0.471	0.149	244
<i>Fairness in Handling Investigations</i>	Females	0.054319	0.169589	0.749	0.1651	246
	Males	0.184835	0.152254	0.226	0.1513	244

Finally, hypothesis three states that women will rate units with higher levels of performance as more legitimate. Table 5 below shows that being assigned to a group with higher performance is significantly and positively correlated with perceptions of seriousness in pursuing investigations and trusting police to do the right thing in the scenario where respondents only know the demographic makeup of police but no policy is discussed (the passive representation scenario) ( $p < 0.001$ ). It is not significant for perceptions of fairness in handling investigations for either men or women. This again shows a consistency in correlation between seriousness and trust.

**Table 5. Effects of Higher Performance on Perceptions of Legitimacy**

	Passive					Active				
	Coeff	St Error	P-Value	R <sup>2</sup>	N	Coeff	St Error	P-Value	R <sup>2</sup>	N
<i>Seriously Pursue Investigation</i>							0.16		0.26	24
	Females	0.839	0.164	<b>0.000</b>	0.179	246	1.124	7	<b>0.000</b>	8
Males	0.776	0.171	<b>0.000</b>	0.173	244	0.668	4	<b>0.000</b>	2	4

<i>Trust Police to Do the Right Thing</i>										
Females	0.747	0.158	<b>0.000</b>	0.171	246	1.059	2	<b>0.000</b>	8	6
							0.15		0.27	24
Males	0.658	0.167	<b>0.000</b>	0.138	244	0.570	9	<b>0.001</b>	9	4
							0.16		0.14	24
<i>Fairness in Handling Investigations</i>										
Females	0.223	0.174	0.202	0.167	246	0.824	2	<b>0.000</b>	5	6
							0.17		0.16	24
Males	0.257	0.170	0.132	0.140	244	0.277	1	<b>0.086</b>	1	4
							0.16		0.15	24

Interestingly, performance matters for men and women in the case where a policy is put into place to improve handling of domestic violence cases in all areas of legitimacy (note:  $p < 0.001$  for all except males in their perception of fairness in handling investigations, which is significant at the  $p < 0.10$  level). This indicates that performance is more important than gender of the officer establishing the policy, and that an effective policy at leads to increased performance is tied to increased perceptions of all types of police legitimacy.

### Research Implications and Limitations

This study contributes to the literature on representative bureaucracy by highlighting the different roles representation and performance play in how respondents rate the legitimacy of police in passive and active representation scenarios in a post-conflict setting. Findings are similar to those in other countries: the representation of women is correlated with higher ratings of legitimacy for women. In the passive representation scenario, where a respondent had little information about the policies of a force and could only see the demographic makeup of police, representation became an important influence on legitimacy for women in each of the dimensions of procedural legitimacy. Increasing the number of women on a force increased their ratings of how seriously police pursue investigations, how much they trusted them to do the right thing, and how fair police are in handling investigations. In contrast, knowing the demographic makeup of the force only influenced men's perceptions that cases would be handled fairly but did not significantly impact their perceptions of how well the case would be carried out in terms of seriously pursuing an investigation and being trusted to do the right thing. This suggests that both men and women associate women with fairness, but that it is shared values and lived experience of women that influence ratings of seriousness and trust, as theorized by existing literature.

Interestingly, performance was significantly correlated with higher ratings for men in the areas of legitimacy where representation did not influence them; namely, men rated seriousness in pursuing an investigation and trusting police to do the right thing when there was higher



performance but not higher representation, and performance was not significant for men in rating how fair police are, though representation was significant to this rating of fairness. For men in scenarios where only demographic information is known and no policy positions have been stated, representation and performance seem to be markedly separate, perhaps suggesting distinct associations with the various aspects of legitimacy, with seriousness and trust on the one hand and fairness on the other. Literature on leadership indicates that fairness is seen as a more stereotypically female trait and that may be playing out in evaluations here (Bruckmüller and Branscombe, 2010). This is affirmed by higher correlations between seriousness and trust and lower correlations of those concepts with fairness. Because fairness seems to be markedly female, it is unsurprising that both men and women think increasing female representation on the force would increase fairness of that force's response to domestic violence. Seriousness in carrying out an investigation and trusting police to do the right thing may be seen as tied to outcomes of an investigation, whereas fairness may be seen as more intrinsically related to how women treat other women.

Local context may also play into these findings. One study found that respondents felt a need for improved inter-institutional cooperation. One respondent said, "Institutions don't know their obligations, they send victims from one institution to another and re-victimize them in this way because they have to tell their story over and over again" (Kosovo Women's Network 2015, p. 315.). Perhaps even if police are seen as being fair, there is a perception that a case will still not come to the "right" conclusions, harming perceptions of trustworthiness and how serious police pursue investigations. There may be little hope for a positive outcome if coordination between institutions does not occur. Further research is warranted.

Turning to the active representation scenario, where a policy was enacted that would benefit victims of domestic violence, performance mattered to both men and women for all three dimensions of legitimacy, whereas information on whether a man or woman enacted the policy had little impact. Respondents seem to care more about the potential outcome of a policy being in place than they do about who is responsible for making the change. This could point to the importance of representation when there is little information on how a force carries out their responsibilities and the only information available to evaluate the force on is whether women are present. However, when an effective policy is put into place, and this is known, respondents can rely on that information to rate officers. Implications of this finding are that if citizens know little about their police forces, representation becomes important. But even a less representative force can gain legitimacy by enacting good policies that benefit less represented groups.

Passive representation may be a means of allowing the under-represented to feel enfranchised, while active representation seeks to put into place policies that benefit under-represented groups. More research should be carried out on how passive and active representation may differ in their end goals and what influences those perceptions, and on how dimensions of legitimacy differ from one another, including whether some aspects of legitimacy are more inherently gendered. Further research on intensity of doses and threshold effects could also be beneficial to understanding representation, performance, and interactions between the two.

## Conclusion

While representative bureaucracy has been studied in a variety of policy areas in the US, little research has been done on citizen perceptions of legitimacy in post-conflict areas. This article used an experimental survey to understand how respondents react to more or less representative police forces and higher and lower performance. In passive scenarios, female respondents rated units with higher female representation as more legitimate along each of the dimensions of legitimacy; for men, ratings only increased for how fair police are in carrying out investigations. Both men and women rated police units as more legitimate in the areas of how seriously they pursued investigations and how trustworthy they were, while performance was not correlated with legitimacy in either group. These findings may support other research that victims of domestic violence will benefit from female police officers. Studies that suggest better outcomes, higher reporting, and more outreach to women are confirmed here by perceptions that female officers can be trusted to do the right thing, will handle cases fairly, and be serious in carrying out investigations. More research should be done in other post-conflict areas and in Kosovo to better understand how representation and performance influence the various dimensions of legitimacy to understand their potential and differing uses as tools for building legitimacy.

## Appendix A

**Table I. Balance Test for Representation in Passive DV Scenario**

	<b>Group 1 Mean</b>	<b>Group 2 Mean</b>	<b>T- value</b>	<b>P- Value</b>
Age (Continuous)	35	37.81	-2.09	<b>0.04</b>
Age	3.46	3.81	-2.13	<b>0.03</b>
Gender (male=1)	0.53	0.48	1.21	0.23
Marital Status	1.56	1.60	-0.92	0.36
Ethnicity	2.63	3.05	-1.81	0.07
Education	3.10	3.01	0.79	0.43
Monthly Income	2.14	2.12	0.29	0.77
Municipality	20.07	19.20	0.85	0.39
Citizenship (y/n)	0.97	0.98	-0.97	0.33
Ethnicity (three groups)	1.50	1.72	-3.03	<b>0.00</b>
Serb (y/n)	0.19	0.20	-0.47	0.64
Albanian (y/n)	0.66	0.54	2.69	0.01

**Table II. Balance Test for Performance in Passive DV Scenario**

	<b>Group 1 Mean</b>	<b>Group 2 Mean</b>	<b>T- value</b>	<b>P- Value</b>
Age (Continuous)	37.14	36.03	0.82	0.41
Age	3.71	3.60	0.67	0.50

Gender (male=1)	0.49	0.51	-0.31	0.76
Marital Status	1.64	1.54	2.03	0.04
Ethnicity	2.83	2.88	-0.23	0.82
Education	3.14	2.97	1.53	0.13
Monthly Income	2.16	2.11	0.54	0.59
Municipality	18.90	20.20	-1.28	0.20
Citizenship (y/n)	0.98	0.97	0.39	0.70
Ethnicity (three groups)	1.62	1.63	-0.11	0.91
Serb (y/n)	0.19	0.20	-0.41	0.68
Albanian (y/n)	0.60	0.59	0.26	0.79

**Table III. Balance Test for Representation in Active DV Scenario**

	Group 1 Mean	Group 2 Mean	T-value	P-Value
Age (Continuous)	36.3012	36.79249	-0.36566	0.714776
Age	3.630522	3.667984	-0.22948	0.818587
Gender (male=1)	0.496032	0.505976	-0.2226	0.823941
Marital Status	1.593074	1.575	0.363602	0.716319
Ethnicity	2.869048	2.849802	0.083955	0.933126
Education	3.04065	3.056	-0.13341	0.893921
Monthly Income	2.114173	2.145669	-0.35379	0.723643
Municipality	19.33071	19.85433	-0.51258	0.608467
Citizenship (y/n)	0.971193	0.979675	-0.60508	0.545406
Ethnicity (three groups)	1.606299	1.637795	-0.43603	0.663004
Serb (y/n)	0.188976	0.204724	-0.44554	0.656117
Albanian (y/n)	0.602362	0.57874	0.540455	0.589121

**Table IV. Balance Test for Representation in Active DV Scenario**

	Group 1 Mean	Group 2 Mean	T-value	P-Value
Age (Continuous)	35.688	37.40278	-1.27823	0.201763
Age	3.544	3.753968	-1.28831	0.198234
Gender (male=1)	0.456	0.545455	-2.01029	0.044936
Marital Status	1.536481	1.630252	-1.89365	0.058886
Ethnicity	2.984064	2.73622	1.082418	0.279585
Education	3.146341	2.952	1.694011	0.090894
Monthly Income	2.170635	2.089844	0.908115	0.36425
Municipality	20.0754	19.11719	0.938551	0.348409
Citizenship (y/n)	0.979339	0.97166	0.547779	0.584095
Ethnicity (three groups)	1.638889	1.605469	0.462659	0.643808
Serb (y/n)	0.218254	0.175781	1.203083	0.229507

Albanian (y/n)      0.571429      0.609375      -0.86856      0.385502

### Table V. Correlations

#### Gender (Passive)

	Serious	Trust	Fair
Serious	1		
Trust	0.8004	1	
Fair	0.5140	0.5411	1

#### Gender (Active)

	Serious	Trust	Fair
Serious	1		
Trust	0.8393	1	
Fair	0.6580	0.6651	1

### References

- Ahmeti, A. (2021, April 6). In Kosovo, System Failing to Protect Domestic Abuse Victims. *Balkan Insight*. Accessed from <https://balkaninsight.com/2021/04/06/in-kosovo-system-failing-to-protect-domestic-abuse-victims/>.
- Andrews, R., Groeneveld, S., Meier, K. J., & Schröter, E. (2016, June). Representative bureaucracy and public service performance: Where, why and how does representativeness work. In *PMRA Public Management Research Conference (Vol. 22)*. Aarhus University.
- Andersen, J. P., & Gustafsberg, H. (2016). A training method to improve police use of force decision making: a randomized controlled trial. *Sage Open*, 6(2).
- Andrews, R., & Johnston Miller, K. (2013). Representative bureaucracy, gender, and policing: The case of domestic violence arrests in England. *Public Administration*, 91(4), 998-1014.
- Arnetz, B. B., Arble, E., Backman, L., Lynch, A., & Lublin, A. (2013). Assessment of a prevention program for work-related stress among urban police officers. *International Archives of Occupational and Environmental Health*, 86, 79-88.

- Arnetz, B. B., Nevedal, D. C., Lumley, M. A., Backman, L., & Lublin, A. (2009). Trauma resilience training for police: Psychophysiological and performance effects. *Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology*, 24, 1-9.
- Brinkerhoff, D. W. (Ed.). (2007). *Governance in post-conflict societies: Rebuilding fragile states*. Routledge.
- Bruckmüller, S., & Branscombe, N. R. (2010). The glass cliff: When and why women are selected as leaders in crisis contexts. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 49(3), 433-451.
- Carlson, M. J., Harris, S. D., & Holden, G. W. (1999). Protective orders and domestic violence: Risk factors for re-abuse. *Journal of Family Violence*, 14(2), 205-226.
- CIA World Factbook (2020). Europe: Kosovo.
- Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo. (2008). Accessed from <http://www.kushtetutakosoves.info/repository/docs/Constitution.of.the.Republic.of.Kosovo.pdf>
- Cromartie, A. (2018). Legitimacy. In *Political concepts*. Manchester University Press.
- Dee, T. S. (2005). Expense preference and student achievement in school districts. *Eastern Economic Journal*, 31(1), 23-44.
- Esman, M. J. (1999). Public administration and conflict management in plural societies: the case for representative bureaucracy. *Public Administration & Development*, 19(4), 353.
- Farnsworth, N., Morina, D., Ryan, D., Rrahmani, G., Robinson-Conlon, V., and Banjska, I. (2018). Kosovo Gender Analysis. Kosovo Women's Network. European Union 4 Kosovo. Retrieved from <https://womensnetwork.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/womens-network.pdf>.
- Francois, M. and I. Sud (2006) 'Promoting Stability and Development in Fragile and Failed States', *Development Policy Review* 24(2): 141–60.
- Futures Without Violence. (n.d.). *Mandatory Reporting of Domestic Violence to Law Enforcement by Health Care Providers: A Guide for Advocates Working to Respond to or Amend Reporting Laws Related to Domestic Violence*.
- Gracia, E. Unreported cases of domestic violence against women: towards an epidemiology of social silence, tolerance, and inhibition. *Journal of Epidemiology & Community Health* 2004; 58:536-537.

- Gap Institute. (2015). Reforming Public Administration in Kosovo. Accessed from [http://www.institutigap.org/documents/99892\\_Reforming%20%20Public%20Administrati on%20in%20Kosovo.pdf](http://www.institutigap.org/documents/99892_Reforming%20%20Public%20Administrati on%20in%20Kosovo.pdf) on April 12, 2018.
- Gilbert, Kimutai. (2019, October 17). Countries That Recognize Kosovo. Retrieved from <https://www.worldatlas.com/articles/which-countries-recognize-kosovo-as-a-country.html>
- Gravier, M. (2013). Challenging or enhancing the EU's legitimacy? The evolution of representative bureaucracy in the Commission's staff policies. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 23(4), 817-838.
- Harris, E. (2008, Feb 17). Q & A: The State of Kosovo. NPR. Retrieved from <https://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=19148459>.
- Haxhiaj, S. (2018). Has the UN's Kosovo Mission Become Obsolete? *Balkan Transitional Justice*. *Balkan Insight*. (Dec 18, 2018). Accessed from <https://balkaninsight.com/2018/12/18/has-the-un-s-kosovo-mission-become-obsolete-12-17-2018/> on April 17, 2019.
- Hindera, J. J. (1993a). Representative bureaucracy: Imprimis evidence of active representation in the EEOC district offices. *Social Science Quarterly*, 74(2), 95-108.
- Hindera, J. J. (1993b). Representative bureaucracy: Further evidence of active representation in the EEOC district offices. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 3(3), 415-429.
- Holt, V. L., Kernic, M. A., Lumley, T., Wolf, M. E., & Rivara, F. P. (2002). Civil protection orders and risk of subsequent police-reported violence. *JAMA*, 288(5), 589-594.
- Hong, S. (2016). Representative bureaucracy, organizational integrity, and citizen coproduction: Does an increase in police ethnic representativeness reduce crime?. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 35(1), 11-33.
- Hurd, I. (2007). Breaking and making norms: American revisionism and crises of legitimacy. *International Politics*, 44(2-3), 194-213.
- The Independent International Commission on Kosovo. (2000). *The Kosovo Report: Conflict, International Response, Lessons Learned*. Oxford University Press. Accessed from <https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/6D26FF88119644CFC1256989005CD392-thekosovoreport.pdf> on April 11, 2018.
- International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY). Judgement List.

- icty.org. Archived from the original on 1 March 2014. See [https://web.archive.org/web/20100827083654/http://www.icty.org/x/cases/limaj/cis/en/cis\\_limaj\\_al\\_en.pdf](https://web.archive.org/web/20100827083654/http://www.icty.org/x/cases/limaj/cis/en/cis_limaj_al_en.pdf) and <https://web.archive.org/web/20140301030130/http://www.icty.org/sid/10095> accessed April 11, 2018.
- Jones, J. (2020). Women in the Kosovo Police. International Criminal Investigative Training Assistance Program. Accessed from chrome-extension://efaidnbnmnnibpcajpcgclclefindmkaj/viewer.html?pdfurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.justice.gov%2Fcriminal-icitap%2Ffile%2F1307176%2Fdownload&clen=5872236&chunk=true&pdfilename=icip-women-in-kosovo-police.pdf.
- Jordan, Jan (2001). "Worlds Apart? Women, Rape and the Police Reporting Process," *British Journal of Criminology*, 41(4): 679–706.
- Keiser, L. R., Wilkins, V. M., Meier, K. J., & Holland, C. A. (2002). Lipstick and logarithms: Gender, institutional context, and representative bureaucracy. *American political science review*, 553-564.
- Kešetović, Ž. M. (2013). Serbian police: Troubled transition from police force to police service. In *Handbook on policing in Central and Eastern Europe* (pp. 217-238). Springer, New York, NY.
- Knox, C. C. (2016). Public administrators' use of social media platforms: Overcoming the legitimacy dilemma?. *Administration & Society*, 48(4), 477-496.
- Koppell, J. G. (2008). Global governance organizations: Legitimacy and authority in conflict. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(2), 177-203.
- Kosovo Women's Network (2015). No More Excuses: An Analysis of Attitudes, Incidence, and Institutional Responses to Domestic Violence in Kosovo, Pg. 65. Available from <https://womensnetwork.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/20151124105025622.pdf>. Accessed Oct 9, 2020.
- Landau, D. M. (2017). The quest for legitimacy in independent Kosovo: the unfulfilled promise of diversity and minority rights. *Nationalities Papers*, 45(3), 442-463.
- Law on the Civil Service of the Republic of Kosovo, No. 03/L-149. (2010). Retrieved from <http://zpd-rks.org/upload/en/legislation/laws/LAW%20ON%20THE%20CIVIL%20SERVICE.pdf>
- Levi, M., & Sacks, A. (2009). Legitimizing beliefs: Sources and indicators. *Regulation & Governance*, 3(4), 311-333.

- Levi, M., Sacks, A., & Tyler, T. (2009). Conceptualizing legitimacy, measuring legitimating beliefs. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 53(3), 354-375.
- Lim, H. H. (2006). Representative bureaucracy: Rethinking substantive effects and active representation. *Public administration review*, 66(2), 193-204.
- Meier, Kenneth J. (1993). "Representative Bureaucracy: A Theoretical and Empirical Exposition." In James Perry, ed. *Research in Public Administration*, vol. 2. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1-36.
- Meier, K. J., & Hawes, D. P. (2009). Ethnic conflict in France: a case for representative bureaucracy?. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 39(3), 269-285.
- Meier, K. J., & Nicholson-Crotty, J. (2006). Gender, representative bureaucracy, and law enforcement: The case of sexual assault. *Public Administration Review*, 66(6), 850-860.
- Meier, K. J., & Nigro, L. G. (1976). Representative bureaucracy and policy preferences: A study in the attitudes of federal executives. *Public Administration Review*, 36(4), 458-469.
- Meier, K. J. & Stewart, J. (1992). The impact of representative bureaucracies: Educational systems and public policies. *American Review of Public Administration* 22:157–71.
- Meier, K. J., Wrinkle, R. D., & Polinard, J. L. (1999). Representative bureaucracy and distributional equity: Addressing the hard question. *The Journal of Politics*, 61(4), 1025-1039.
- Mosher, F.C. (1968). *Democracy and the public service*. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press.
- Mertus, J. (1999). *Kosovo: How myths and truths started a war*. Univ of California Press.
- Miller, Amalia R. and Carmit Segal (2012). "Does Temporary Affirmative Action Produce Persistent Effects? A Study of Black and Female Employment in Law Enforcement," *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 94(4): 1107–1125.
- Murdoch, Z., Connolly, S., & Kassim, H. (2018). Administrative legitimacy and the democratic deficit of the European Union. *Journal of European Public Policy*, 25(3), 389-408.
- National Democratic Institute (2019 March). *Kosovo Public Opinion Survey*. National Democratic Institute. Accessed from <https://www.ndi.org/sites/default/files/NDI%20Kosovo%20Public%20Opinion%20Poll%202019.pdf>.



- The New York Times. April 1987. <https://www.nytimes.com/1987/04/25/world/yugoslavia-police-and-10000-clash-during-a-protest-over-ethnic-bias.html?mtrref=www.google.com&gwh=A993CC45DC49AB9438EAA23DB28F9E78&gwt=pay>
- Nicholson-Crotty, J., Grissom, J. A., & Nicholson-Crotty, S. (2011). Bureaucratic representation, distributional equity, and democratic values in the administration of public programs. *The Journal of Politics*, 73(2), 582-596.
- Nicholson-Crotty, Sean, Jill Nicholson-Crotty, and Sergio Fernandez. 2017. Will more black cops matter? Officer race and police-involved homicides of black citizens. *Public Administration Review* 77: 206–16.
- Norris, M. (2008, February 18). Former Yugoslavia 101: The Balkans Breakup. NPR. Retrieved from <https://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=19148459>.
- OSCE Mission in Kosovo (2013). The Implementation of Civil Service Legislation in Kosovo. Accessed from <https://www.osce.org/kosovo/99606?download=true> on April 10, 2018.
- OSCE Mission in Kosovo (2019, March 11). Strong Women on the Rise in Kosovo Police. Retrieved from <https://www.osce.org/mission-in-kosovo/413726>
- Parsons, T. 1960. *Structure and process in modern societies*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.
- Peters, B. G., von Maravić, P., & Schröter, E. (Eds.). (2015). *Politics of representative bureaucracy: Power, legitimacy and performance*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Percy, N., Silber, L., Macqueen, A., Mitchell, P., Ellis, R., Brian Lapping Associates., British Broadcasting Corporation., ... Studio Canal+. (1995). *The death of Yugoslavia*. London: BBC.
- Peterson, John. (2012). New Demography Figures in Kosovo are Significant for Minorities. European Centre for Minority Issues. Accessed from <http://www.infoecmi.eu/index.php/new-demography-figures-in-kosovo-are-significant-for-minorities/> on April 13, 2018.
- Pitts, D. W. (2007). Representative bureaucracy, ethnicity, and public schools: Examining the link between representation and performance. *Administration & Society*, 39(4), 497-526.
- Radio Gorazdevac. (2020, January 31). Returnee Safety: Interethnic Incidents or Crimes Against Property. Retrieved from <https://kossev.info/returnee-safety-interethnic-incidents-or-crimes-against-property/>

- Riccucci, N. M., Van Ryzin, G. G., & Jackson, K. (2018). Representative bureaucracy, race, and policing: A survey experiment. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 28(4), 506-518.
- Riccucci, N. M., & Van Ryzin, G. G. (2017). Representative bureaucracy: A lever to enhance social equity, coproduction, and democracy. *Public Administration Review*, 77(1), 21-30.
- Riccucci, N. M., Van Ryzin, G. G., & Lavena, C. F. (2014). Representative bureaucracy in policing: Does it increase perceived legitimacy?. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 24(3), 537-551.
- Rogel, C. (2003). Kosovo: Where it all began. *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society*, 17(1), 167-182.
- Rutherford, A. (2016). The effect of top-management team heterogeneity on performance in institutions of higher education. *Public Performance & Management Review*, 40(1), 119-144.
- Scholte, J. A., & Tallberg, J. (2018). Theorizing the Institutional Sources of Global Governance Legitimacy. *Legitimacy in Global Governance: Sources, Processes, and Consequences*, 56-74.
- Schuck, A. M. (2018). Women in policing and the response to rape: Representative bureaucracy and organizational change. *Feminist Criminology*, 13(3), 237-259.
- Selden, S. C. (1997). Representative bureaucracy: Examining the linkage between passive and active representation in the Farmers Home Administration. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 27(1), 22-42.
- Scott, W. R. 1977. Effectiveness of organizational effectiveness studies. In P. S. Goodman & J. M. Pennings (Eds.), *New perspectives on organizational effectiveness*: 63-95. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Scott, W. R., & Meyer, J. W. 1991. The organization of societal sectors. In W. W. Powell & P. J. DiMaggio (Eds.), *The new institutionalism in organizational analysis*: 108-140. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Sharp, E. B. (2014). Minority representation and order maintenance policing: Toward a contingent view. *Social Science Quarterly*, 95(4), 1155-1171.
- Sowa, J. E., & Selden, S. C. (2003). Administrative discretion and active representation: An expansion of the theory of representative bureaucracy. *Public Administration Review*, 63(6), 700-710.

- Suchman, Mark C. 1995. Managing legitimacy: Strategic and institutional approaches. *Academy of Management Review* 20:571–610.
- Sun, Ivan. (2007). Policing Domestic Violence: Does Officer Gender Matter?. *Journal of Criminal Justice*. 35. 581-595. 10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2007.09.004.
- Tallberg, J., & Zürn, M. (2019). The legitimacy and legitimation of international organizations: Introduction and framework.
- Theobald, N. A., & Haider-Markel, D. P. (2008). Race, bureaucracy, and symbolic representation: Interactions between citizens and police. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 19(2), 409-426.
- Thompson, F. J. (1976). Minority groups in public bureaucracies: Are passive and active representation linked?. *Administration & Society*, 8(2), 201-226.
- UNMIK Fact Sheet (2019). United Nations Peacekeeping. Accessed from <https://peacekeeping.un.org/en/mission/unmik> on April 17, 2019.
- UNMIK Media Reports (2019, December 23. Afternoon Edition. Retrieved from <https://media.unmikonline.org/?m=20191223>.
- UNMIK Media Reports (2019, December 24). Afternoon Edition. Retrieved from <https://media.unmikonline.org/?p=106970>.
- UNMIK Media Reports (2020, February 3). Afternoon Edition. Retrieved from <https://media.unmikonline.org/?m=20200203>.
- UN Resolution (1999). UN Security Council Resolution 1244. Accessed from <https://undocs.org/S/RES/1244> on April 11, 2018.
- UN Women (2011). Progress of the World's Women. Accessed from <https://www.unwomen.org/-/media/headquarters/attachments/sections/library/publications/2011/progressoftheworldswomen-2011-en.pdf?la=en&vs=2835> on Oct 9, 2020.
- UN Women (2017). Bringing Women on Equal Footing with men in Kosovo Police. Feb. 24, 2017. Accessed from <https://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2017/2/feature-bringing-women-on-equal-footing-with-men-in-kosovo-police> on Oct 9, 2020.
- UN Women (2018). Domestic violence units of Kosovo police train in effective response to violence against women. July 2, 2018. Accessed from <https://eca.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2018/07/domestic-violence-units-of-kosovo-police-train-in-effective-response-to-violence-against-women>.

- UN Women (2019). Recognizing domestic violence as a criminal offence, a big step towards justice for women in Kosovo. June 8, 2020. Accessed from <https://eca.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2020/6/recognizing-domestic-violence-as-a-criminal-offence-a-big-step-towards-justice-for-women-in-kosovo>.
- US Agency for International Development (2005) Fragile States Strategy. [http://www.usaid.gov/policy/2005\\_fragile\\_states\\_strategy.pdf](http://www.usaid.gov/policy/2005_fragile_states_strategy.pdf).
- US Department of Justice. 2018. ICITAP: Europe and Eurasia. <https://www.justice.gov/criminal-icitap/europe-and-eurasia>. Accessed 4/9/2019.
- US Department of Justice. 2009. Practical Implications for Current Domestic Violence Research: For Law Enforcement, Prosecutors and Judges. Accessed from: <chrome-extension://efaidnbmnnnibpcajpcgclefindmkaj/viewer.html?pdfurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.ojp.gov%2Fpdffiles1%2Fnij%2F225722.pdf&cldn=1511011&chunk=true>
- US Embassy Pristina (2018). Video. Retrieved from <https://www.facebook.com/watch/?v=2433797766646364>.
- US State Department. 1997. *Country Report for Human Rights Practices of 1997*. Washington, D.C., US Government Printing Office.
- Van Riper, Paul. 1958 *History of the United States Civil Service*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Vannier, A. (2019, April 20). SERBIA, KOSOVO AND ALBANIA: BETWEEN UNIONS AND DISUNIONS. *The New Federalist*. Retrieved from <https://www.thenewfederalist.eu/serbia-kosovo-and-albania-between-unions-and-disunions?lang=fr>.
- Weizman, J. (2019, Dec. 17). Belgrade Appoints Serb Officials in Northern Kosovo. *Balkan Insight*. Accessed from <https://balkaninsight-com.proxyiub.uits.iu.edu/2019/12/17/belgrade-appoints-serb-officials-in-northern-kosovo/>.
- Wilkins, V. M. (2007). Exploring the causal story: Gender, active representation, and bureaucratic priorities. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 17(1), 77-94.
- Wilkins, V. M., & Keiser, L. R. (2006). Linking passive and active representation by gender: The case of child support agencies. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 16(1), 87-102.

Wilkins, V. M., & Williams, B. N. (2008). Black or blue: Racial profiling and representative bureaucracy. *Public Administration Review*, 68(4), 654-664.